

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
TYLER DIVISION**

MANHATTANLIFE INSURANCE AND ANNUITY  
COMPANY, PASCHALL AND ASSOCIATES, INC.,  
and WILLIAM C. PASCHALL,

*Plaintiffs,*

v.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
AND HUMAN SERVICES, ET AL.,

*Defendants.*

Civil Action No. 6:24-cv-00178-JCB

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**

Please take notice that the Defendants hereby appeal to the United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit from the final judgment entered on December 4, 2024, ECF No. 36.

Respectfully submitted,

BRETT A. SHUMATE  
Acting Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Division

MICHELLE BENNETT  
Assistant Director  
Federal Programs Branch

*/s/ James Bickford*  
JAMES BICKFORD  
Trial Attorney (N.Y. Bar No. 5163498)  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
1100 L Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
James.Bickford@usdoj.gov  
Telephone: (202) 305-7632  
Facsimile: (202) 616-8470

*Counsel for Defendants*

Date: February 3, 2025